



**Minutes of the 4th Transnational Meeting of the ADiBE Project,
organized by the University of Jaén, Spain, December 10th and 11th,
2021**

December 10th

SPACE: Online via Zoom (<https://uso2web.zoom.us/j/87536121047>)

STARTING TIME 9.30 CET

ATTENDANCE

Attendants: Silvia Bauer-Marschallinger, Kim Bower, Tatjana Bucovsky, Antonio Vicente Casas Pedrosa, Do Coyle, Valentina Cueva López, Christiane Dalton-Puffer, Lena Katzinger, Raúl Landa Navarro, Karita Mård-Miettinen, Frauke Matz, Tarja Nikula-Jääntti, Marisa Pérez Cañado, Diego Rascón Moreno, Philipp Siepmann, Kristiina Skinnari, Ute Smit, and Y.L. Teresa Ting.

Ricardo Römhild and Dominik Rumlich are excused.

1- Welcome

The session begins with members greeting each other and with the Coordinator of the project asking all partners, one by one, how they are and which the health situation is in their countries. She virtually welcomes all attendants to the University of Jaén, where this final transnational meeting would have been physically hosted if the Omicron variant had not broken out and had not caused the number of people infected by COVID-19 to spiral. After sharing some facts about the young but recognized university, Marisa Pérez Cañado informs that the next annual conference of the most important association of Bilingual Education in Spain (<https://www.ebspain.es/>) will take place at the University of Jaén from October 21st to 23rd, 2022 and warmly

extends an invitation to attend and thus physically visit Jaén and its university. Then, she presents the conference dossier, which had been modified in the last few days to adapt it to the virtual environment. She also thanks the country teams for accommodating to the schedule.

2- Stocktaking on Output 1

The Coordinator provides a detailed breakdown of all the work that has been carried out vis-à-vis Output 1. All the objectives envisaged have been attained and, given the substantial outcomes that have been achieved in terms of sample size, analysis, dissemination, and publication by all countries in the *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism* (IJBE) (a top-tier journal), it can be convincingly said that the mission set for this output has been accomplished. She suggests the possibility of having the whole special issue be published in open access, by using money from the project management and implementation budget, and her proposal is accepted by all. Austria and the UK, which have already paid for their articles to be freely available, would be excluded from the costs.

As for further dissemination and sustainability, Marisa Pérez Cañado asks for additional talks / plenaries and publications that may be coming apart from those she knows that are envisaged for the Netherlands, USA, Portugal and Spain, on the one hand, and the article she has participated in with Philipp Siepmann, on the other hand. She informs that there have been nearly 50 participations in conferences (organized in 13 countries) on ADiBE. The Finnish team adds a recent talk that they have given and one organized for next February, both of which are jotted down. It is encouraged that these and other ones that may be coming in the near future are emailed to Diego Rascón Moreno so that they are reflected on the webpage. Marisa Pérez Cañado finishes her report on Output 1 by profusely thanking all members for their outstanding work in this respect.

3- Stocktaking on Output 2

Teresa Ting, the leader of the Italian team in charge of Output 2, expounds on the structure that the ADiBE library of materials will have. This open-education resource publication will begin with a welcome document including the principles and values that will be addressed through all the projects, a link to the teacher training course designed as Output 3, and a reference to the recorded videoguides as Output 4. At the end of it there will be a hyperlink to the information tables for each of the 12 projects, which the reader will be able to use to search for specific disciplines, disciplinary

concepts, CLIL languages, CEFR levels, age-groups, competences, skills, literacies, etc. The projects will be accessed from the top of the corresponding table.

Diego Rascón Moreno enquires whether there will be a whole document containing all projects (preceded by the introductory documents) apart from standalone files. Some colleagues intervene and do not recommend it. Then, Philipp Siepmann asks about the possibility of creating teacher and student versions for the materials. This is discussed for a few minutes and it is agreed that they will not be necessary as the projects were devised especially having the teacher in mind as user. Moreover, it will be explicitly said in the introduction, serving as a training manual, that the sets of materials should be adopted and adapted to each teacher's context. Do Coyle frames them as a "resources bank", which Tarja Nikula-Jääntti and Kim Bower like.

Afterwards, Philipp Siepmann shares the German team's experience in creating interactive projects that include quite a few hyperlinks to go to specific sections and tasks, and then go back up to their own table of contents and initial pages. Despite the results having been very positive, working in this manner entailed a significant challenge, so he recommends that navigation throughout the document is achieved by means of bookmarks instead. Some doubts are raised about the feasibility of doing it due to time constraints and difficulty. Philipp Siepmann shares [this document](#) on how to add bookmarks in pdf documents (the format of the typeset projects) and offers to create simple instructions towards it. The agreement is reached that at least a minimum of five bookmarks will be introduced for each project so that there is certain homogeneity in this respect. It is planned that when the country teams review the typeset version of their materials they will create some bookmarks or, if not versed on how to do it, they will indicate where exactly they would like bookmarks to go, so that Marien Fernández Sabariego, the typesetter, can do it for them.

Marisa Pérez Cañado brings up the possibility of publishing these Output 2 materials with Trinity College, one of the associated partners of the ADiBE project. The pros and cons of doing so are commented on and the decision is made to publish them with Creative Commons License and an ISBN which will be independently obtained. Diego Rascón Moreno then showcases some examples of the typesetting. The Coordinator expresses huge gratitude to Teresa Ting for the amazing job done on these heterogeneous sets of materials and the top-notch outcome.

Following Diego Rascón Moreno's illustration of the typeset work done up to that moment, it is decided that the country name will not be foregrounded at the header of each set and will be replaced with "ADiBE", and that credit to the individual teams

(country and author names) will be given at the end. After being thanked for liaising with Teresa, the teams, and the typesetter, and for the glimpse of the formatted materials, the stocktaking on Output 2 ends and the session is interrupted for a half-an-hour coffee break.

4- Stocktaking on Output 3

Do Coyle expresses her view that the trial and pioneer course that has been created is a result that can be reconfigured, adapted, and adopted to different areas and contexts. She sees it as a package that has got lots of potential. She reports that the participants' feedback to it was generally incredibly positive, with the notion that perhaps it should be more practical. An original teacher development course in an accessible format is now available to the ADiBE members.

The leader of the University of Edinburgh deeply thanks Raúl Landa Navarro and his team at the *Centro de Profesorado* (CEP) de Córdoba for helping Kim Bower and herself transform their ideas into something that looked very nice in Moodle or as nice as it could be as far as the learning platform allowed. They have achieved to go beyond differentiating in terms of ability but also in terms of content tasks and learning outcomes. She adds that Raúl created an unofficial copy of the 20-hour course and every member of the ADiBE team has access to that and she suggests that it is put somewhere safe and handy. A back-up copy of the course is ready to be uploaded in any Moodle or virtual environment.

The program can be used as is, it can be adapted as a course, and, also, it can be used as a library of resources and some of its elements can be integrated into different courses. Do Coyle gives the example of what she has done in initial teacher education programs for Primary and Secondary, and she encourages all ADiBE members to use the lovely resources that were jointly created. She thinks that their dissemination in the next few years could be celebrated. She will definitely be using them in most of her courses on social justice and inclusion, which she believes to be mandatory.

Raúl Landa Navarro then takes it over. He begins by thanking everybody and Do Coyle in particular, as Coordinator of this output, for their work towards producing such a high-quality teacher development program that has been run by his institution. He informs that the CEP of Córdoba is presently running the second edition of the course, which –due to the first edition participants' opinions– has been increased to 30 hours.

He expands on the copy of the course all project colleagues can access. He shares the link to it and instructions for access, and adds that every member must be able to enter it via their email account. He also provides details of the profile of teachers who are participating in the current second edition (there are now more beginners in the CLIL approach) and of the survey answers given by the teachers participating in the pilot course (first edition). He highlights from these the satisfaction with the international nature of the course and the learning log. On the downside, participants found it a bit hard and they needed more practical tips (as was mentioned earlier).

Raúl Landa Navarro's personal suggestions for improvement (some of them clarified after Do Coyle's interventions) have to do with designing reflective activities so that learners become aware of how the ADiBE principles are present in them, assessment on attention to diversity, adaption to beginning (CLIL) teachers or, rather, ensuring that they have a different entry point, and to track transfer and impact of the course. As lately he has been required to do it with the CEP courses, he will do it with the ADiBE one. It is also worth mentioning that, as the end of the stocktaking on this output, Do Coyle insists on thanking Raúl and the CEP teachers involved (Neda Mirova and América Pérez) and of course Kim Bower, part of the elaboration team.

Ute Smit expresses her gratitude for the clear explanations, coordination and piloting of the course, and comments that it would be positive to know what comes out of the use of these materials by teachers in different contexts from now on; Christiane Dalton-Puffer reminds attendants about the existence of a folder devoted to this output in the common Google Drive repository; and Marisa Pérez Cañado thanks the UK team and Raúl Landa Navarro for the stellar work that they have done in the development and perfect fine-tuning to the specific Andalusian context, respectively, of a course which is already making waves. She happily reports that some of its materials have also been piloted with the Junta de Andalucía, incorporated into the bilingual master's degrees at the University of Jaén, Córdoba and Alcalá de Henares, and that they will be part of one of the modules of the common accreditation certificate that is being created at the University of Jaén to teach bilingually.

5- Stocktaking on Output 4

Christiane Dalton-Puffer reviews the initial objectives set for this output, mainly that the so-called "CLIL pills" should be short videos addressing the core questions of the ADiBE project for teachers and teacher educators. Each national team selected their favorite questions and topics out of those that had been previously collected and collated in a table when working in breakout rooms in earlier online meetings. They

were in charge of three videoguides. Everybody wrote their scripts, there was a mutual feedback process, then filming went on in different locations, the videos were sent, and Lena Katzinger did the editing during the summer (involving a first round of editing, sending the videos for feedback, and incorporating it in a final version).

Lena continues to mention that a final list of all the videos is available on the corresponding Google Drive folder (“ADiBE project current” > “Output 4”). Their order is based on the six principles, preceded by seven videos about general topics. She goes through each principle, commenting on the number of videos and respective authors focusing on them. Christiane and Lena highlight that although there is not a total balance in terms of how many videos cover each principle, there is at least one for each, and this was the outcome of leaving the process relatively open so that everybody had the choice of what they wanted to work on.

Lena Katzinger informs that the raw videos themselves are also available in the aforementioned folder for all partners to already use. They should be uploaded to YouTube following their numerical order so that they are classified in that platform following the topic sequence. Teresa Ting asks about the subtitles, to what the Austrian team responds YouTube will automatically generate them. In any case, Lena will make a final check and correct any possible mistake (which is likely to happen with acronyms, for example). As she has all the scrips from the editing phase, she will be able to do it easily.

Then, Kim Bower brings up the issue of having recorded a video that will not be included in the final list of CLIL pills. The Austrian team clarifies what happened, and once it is evident that there was a misunderstanding, it is decided that the final list of videoguides is kept in the round figure of 20 (three by each country with the exception of the UK and Spain, which will contribute to the list with four each).

The Austrian and Spanish teams agree that the latter will upload, in order, all the videoguides from the Google Drive folder where they currently are to the ADiBE YouTube account, and that later, in January, after the Christmas vacation, the former will check for the accuracy of the subtitles. The partners (via the chat) and the Coordinator of the project thank the University of Vienna partner for their outstanding job.

6- Financial report

Antonio Vicente Casas Pedrosa (Nono) begins the financial report by summarising the budget that was given to the project and how it was allocated into different concepts

(outputs, transnational meetings, and management and implementation) and broken down into each institution, as was shared in the first transnational meeting in Córdoba. He also refers to the Mobility Tool platform where he had to upload all the information, and reminds all partners when the payments regarding the outputs were made by SEPIE and that the final 20% corresponding to outputs 2, 3 and, 4 is expected some months after submitting the final report of the project as long as it is positively assessed.

He then informs of the current status of the budget associated with the transnational meetings, and the management and implementation. As for the former, he mentions that according to the SEPIE maybe a small amount of the money intended for the last two meetings could be transferred to other concepts, but that it was not 100% certain. If that was the case, money would be received in relation to the third transnational meeting since it was held online, but the situation about the fourth one is different as transport bookings were made and a small sum of money will be reimbursed because of not travelling and changing the meeting from a physical to an online environment (forced by a sudden worsening of the COVID pandemic).

There are a couple of payments pending connected with the project management and implementation budget: the second half of the typesetter's bill and the open-access publication of the IJBEB articles. The latter will only be divided into five institutions, as Austria and the UK already paid for that on their own, not using ADiBE money. Antonio Vicente asks the attendants about transferring the second 40% of the budget allocated to the fourth intellectual output, now that it has been completed. Given the agreement of all, it will happen after the meeting, as soon as it is possible.

A round of questions and comments follow. First, Christiane Dalton-Puffer enquires about any possible sum of the project management and implementation budget remaining after all the bills have been paid, and Nono answers that it would be transferred to each institution. Christiane adds that the typesetting costs amazingly good value, with which the Spanish team agrees and admits that it was likely owing to previous work relationships. Second, Frauke Matz requests a brief letter to show her university confirming that she is the recipient of the ADiBE money when the next payments are made, and Do Coyle joins that petition, in her case for Edinburgh University. Thirdly, Teresa Ting remarks that being warned that the transfer has just been made is highly appreciated. Fourthly, Diego Rascón Moreno, who is in charge of collecting the timesheets reporting each team's work on outputs 2-4 (those which are funded) in case SEPIE demands them, reminds everyone that they must be sent to him shortly. He states that he will immediately forward to the institution leaders the thread

of messages exchanged earlier in May, as in that conversation doubts were solved and guidance was given towards their elaboration.

Partners are profoundly grateful to Antonio Vicente Casas Pedrosa (Nono) for his clear exposition of the financial situation and for staying behind the administration to label every single payment. Further thanks go to him from the Coordinator of the project for his impeccable work on the accounting, and for being so precise, thorough, and painstaking. Marisa Pérez Cañado closes the session at 13.15, summoning attendants to the next day's meeting.

December 11th

SPACE: Online via Zoom (<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/82898671577>)

STARTING TIME 9.30 CET

ATTENDANCE:

Attendants: Kim Bower, Tatjana Bucovsky, Antonio Vicente Casas Pedrosa, Do Coyle, Valentina Cueva López, Christiane Dalton-Puffer, Helen Heaney, Lena Katzinger, Nina Lancaster, Raúl Landa Navarro, Karita Mård-Miettinen, Frauke Matz, Tarja Nikula-Jääntti, Marisa Pérez Cañado, Diego Rascón Moreno, Philipp Siepmann, Ute Smit, and Y.L. Teresa Ting.

7- Work on the *Guidelines Manual*

The Coordinator of the project welcomes back the ADiBE members and Nina Lancaster, who could not attend the previous day, to the final meeting of the project.

As the general guidelines manual is practically set up with the ADiBE principles and basic traits of the materials, the purpose is to create a subsection for each country illustrating how those principles and main traits are included within each team's set of materials. Nina Lancaster delivers a clear presentation of how this has been done in the Spanish materials, using a combination of text and screenshots. Philipp Siepmann does the same with the German materials. The idea is that both options serve as a jump-off point before attendants work on theirs in groups.

Nina and Philipp give insights into how they developed the guidelines for the Spanish and German projects, respectively. They share the document, PowerPoint presentation, and the article itself that they have just shown. The Coordinator of the project thanks them for their top-notch work, which will be of tremendous help so that, basically, each country illustrates each ADiBE principle including examples from the materials and referring to the three phases (those that distinguished them).

Some members express some doubts in terms of the homogeneity of the task across all sets of materials. Thus, it is agreed that between 300 and 500 words will be devoted to each principle, that the same structure covering the six principles (underpinnings + seeing them with practical examples) will be followed, that the Word program will be used, that the guidelines will refer to the entire set of materials produced by a country, and that whatever it takes will be done to ensure that it is really offering the reader insight and helping the teacher understand and fully capture the essence of the specific country materials.

It is clarified that a bullet-point format will also be possible, and that the resulting document will be typeset and published with an ISBN as a guidelines manual. Philipp recommends having a look at the information on the principles that the German team included in the materials and that he has extracted from them and shared on the chat. That way of gleaning insight into the principles is shorter, takes into account the checklists that were designed for each of the ADiBE principles (with which the manual will start off, so wording them will be unnecessary), and can be used as another source of inspiration –together with Nina’s and Philipp’s aforementioned illustrative examples– for the intended task that the UK, Finnish, Austrian and Italian teams have ahead.

Afterwards, colleagues work in breakout rooms. A basic outline or plan is drawn up, but there is not enough time to write the specific guidelines manual of each of the remaining countries’ set of materials. Therefore, the 17th of January is set as the deadline to finish it. A coffee break from 11.00 to 11.30 follows.

8- Webpage and social media

The last leg of this final transnational meeting basically focuses on dissemination and sustainability of the project, as the final steps that need to be kept going well beyond is completion. Specifically, this point on the agenda was to report on the webpage and social media of the project. On the one hand, Diego Rascón Moreno shows the updated status of the website by navigating through all its sections and

subsections. Christiane Dalton-Puffer asks whether the materials and the videoguides could be more prominent. The design of the webpage is visually very attractive and its structure is clear, sticking to the project proposal. However, thinking about future users of the site, she asks whether materials and videoguides could be more prominent in it, becoming immediately visible somehow.

The Spanish team totally agrees with Christiane's suggestion and promises to ask the webmaster, David Soto, to make each of the outputs more salient, perhaps through some kind of pop-up or extra tabs on top. Teresa Ting also suggests that, in the title of Output 2, "Activities" is changed to "Materials", which is also jotted down.

On the other hand, Valentina Cueva López gives an overview of what has been done in the Twitter and Facebook accounts of the project. She and Diego will keep on being coordinated so that when the coming relevant changes in terms of showcasing the outputs are made to the website these are announced in the social media, thereby ensuring that different ways of dissemination are intertwined. Marisa Pérez Cañado thanks them for their effort, adds that messages and pictures about this meeting will be posted on both platforms later in the day, urges members (particularly young ones) to share further ideas, and encourages everyone to send Diego any conference or dissemination activity that can be included in the future full update of the website in January.

9- Final report

The following minutes are devoted to the final report that SEPIE will ask for once the project has finished. Its Coordinator goes through the fronts that the document will probably consist of, considering the experience of the interim report. Most of its sections will be written up by her and the Spanish team, such as: the stocktaking on the accomplishment of the objectives, the activities that could be financed with the project management and implementation money, how the project was monitored and who took care of it, and how each member has contributed to the project. However, there are three aspects that she believes will benefit from a brief brainstorming so that no essential aspect is missed.

Firstly, she refers to the involvement of unofficial partners. She reviews all the initial ones and those which incorporated later, either as associated (The Regional Education Board of Calabria) or external (CARLEE, the University of Paderborn, and the University of Nazarbayev) partners. The Austrian team then communicates the recent change of affiliation of Silvia Bauer-Marschallinger to the University College of

Christian Churches for Teacher Education Vienna/Krems. These further incorporations lead to a greater outreach of ADiBE.

Secondly, the difficulties encountered and their causes are thrashed out, mainly the delay in the timeline of Output 1 (its causes being: translating and adapting each of the instruments to the specific contexts took more time than predicted, there was a different academic calendar in implementation, and applying them in five times as many high schools as initially envisaged); replacing the piloting of Output 2 materials with the administration of a brief validated questionnaire to certain teachers in each country due to Covid-19 (Marisa Pérez Cañado seizes the opportunity to ask members to (re)send them to Diego Rascón Moreno, who will centralize and forward them all to Valentina Cueva López for the statistical analysis); and having to cancel a face-to-face version of the last two transnational meetings and to carry out the teacher development course (Output 3) fully online as a consequence of the pandemic. On the upside, these meetings and the course have beautifully adapted to the virtual scenario and, as highlighted by Frauke Matz, the usage of ADiBE materials has probably been wider thanks to the increase of digitalization in schools derived from the health crisis.

Thirdly, the Coordinator touches upon the impact on the target groups and dissemination. She asks for any additional data to the one provided within the interim report for any of the different levels. Locally, apart from newspaper articles published in Jaén and Münster, the German team reports that they have described the project in university lectures and in [a space of their university's website](#), and Helen Heaney informs that she will be using the videoguides in schools in February 2022. Regionally, the ADiBE project has been showcased on radio and TV interviews by Marisa Pérez Cañado and in the think-tank set up by the Andalusian government, and also presented in a CLIL teacher education event by Philipp Siepmann. At the national level, the talks at CIEB, networking with CARLEE in La Rioja, collaborations with the British Council, and a podcast are highlighted as for Spain. Then, at the European level, how the ADiBE materials and activities will be worked in through two key lines of action of the NEOLAIA university alliance is remarked. To finish, internationally, the webpage, the social media, the Powtoon, the leaflets, the prominence of ADiBE in the Intercollegiate Master's on bilingual education coordinated by the University of Jaén and in those on teacher education run by the universities of Edinburgh and Münster, research stays at Florida International University and San Diego State University, the replication of the instruments in Morocco and Kazakhstan, and conferences and publications are mentioned.

10- Further dissemination and sustainability

This point in the agenda ties in with the previous one. On this occasion, stocktaking and brainstorming are done at the same time. The Coordinator of the project reviews everything that was set out to achieve. It is checked that, for dissemination, everything that was mentioned in the application has been actually done, with the exception of, for example, what was intended vis-à-vis regional, national, and European platforms. It is jotted down that this is pending and that it will be figured out how to upload the outputs on the online portals mentioned in the application. The Finnish Agency for Education and the S.O.F.I.A. (for Italian teacher training) platforms are suggested, but the option of disseminating the products there too will be explored once they are totally finished. Christiane Dalton-Puffer also mentions the CLIL-REN of AILA, agreeing to draw up what will be sent for their newsletter; and the German, Finnish, and Spanish teams add that teacher networks can also be informed.

In terms of international conferences, over 60 can be counted and the participation in the coming congresses in 2022 is pointed out. Concerning seminars/webinars, the past ones with the British Council (on rethinking inclusion), Sheffield Hallam University, and AILA, as well as the next ones run by NABE, WorldCLIL, and CIEB are mentioned. The 2022 national webinar and conference organized by the Finnish and Austrian teams, respectively, could also be included as long as they have spaces focused on ADiBE.

The dissemination has also occurred through specific courses by the Federal University of Bahia in Brazil, UNED, Junta de Andalucía in Baeza (Jaén), the CEP of Córdoba, and a summer school funded by Madrid's regional government. The sustainability of the project can be claimed on the grounds of the repeated offer of some of these activities: e.g. Kim Bower confirms that the 2023 CLIL event in Sheffield will devote a section to attention to diversity, Raúl Landa Navarro reports that the CEP course is now part of the official in-service call for all CLIL teachers in Andalusia, the summer school in which Do Coyle has participated will run again, and another one funded by the Basque Country will be organized.

Moreover, the ADiBE work, primarily the CEP's teacher training module, is meant to live on through Modern Language Centres, EMI courses, and bilingual accreditation certificates, as well as via undergraduate and especially postgraduate programs in which the partners are involved (e.g. MAs in bilingual education / language education / education / TESOL offered by the Universities of Jaén, Córdoba, Alcalá de Henares, Münster, and Edinburgh). The publication of Output 1 (both results and all research instruments) in an open-access special issue of the IJBEB journal, the free availability

of the ADiBE website for at least five additional years, the use of the platforms mentioned above, and the existence of the YouTube channel containing the videoguides further guarantee the sustainability of the project after its completion. In fact, for end of master's dissertations, the study has already been replicated in Ecuador, Guatemala, Brazil, and the Valencian bilingual community in Spain, and not only in Secondary but also in Primary education.

11- Final wrap-up

Marisa Pérez Cañado, the Coordinator of the project, wraps up the meeting. After saying that this meeting has been very productive as usual, she extends an enormous thank you to the Spanish team for making this unfamiliar and new endeavour a pleasurable experience, and states how grateful she is to the European team for having learnt so much from them and for having made the project be the academic highlight of her career. She hopes that their paths cross again in the future, e.g. next October in Jaén for CIEB. Afterwards, the Coordinator of the project is showered with praise for having been an excellent leader. Members express that this has been an amazing academic experience and say goodbye to each other. The final transnational meeting of the ADiBE project finishes at 12.50.

THE COORDINATOR

Marisa Pérez Cañado

THE SECRETARY

Diego Rascón Moreno



GOBIERNO
DE ESPAÑA

MINISTERIO
DE CIENCIA, INNOVACIÓN
Y UNIVERSIDADES



Erasmus+